Propaganda



PHIL 3050/5050

David Hildebrand, University of Colorado Denver "Remote": Synchronous and Asynchronous Online Class Synchronous Dates: 8/22, 9/5, 9/12, 10/3, 10/17, 10/31, 11/14, 12/5

Time: 5 p.m. to 7:50 p.m.

Course Description: All who live in this world must choose what to do. Some of those choices can rely on first-hand experience, but most rely on information, facts, and descriptions from external sources. As every programmer will tell you, "Garbage in, garbage out." Thus, getting "good" information is critical to our ability to live freely, autonomously, and ethically. It is typical for philosophy classes to teach logic and reasoning -- and those are important. But reasoning is useless if its content (or information) is deceptive, misleading, or incoherent. What's more, since democratic countries are premised upon knowledgeable citizens, the short-circuiting of reasoning by propaganda may be the greatest danger democracy has.

The question becomes: what is propaganda? How do we define it? How do we locate it? And finally, how do we spell out what's (possibly) wrong with it? Accordingly, this course is an inquiry into the epistemic, technological, and ethical dimensions of propaganda. It will define propaganda, identify how it works, and seek to understand the variety of agents and motives who use propaganda to achieve their ends. (It is not assumed that propaganda is always good or always bad, by the way.) In addition to understanding the logical and epistemic nature of propaganda, this course will examine how it is disseminated. How do technologies (text, video, social media, algorithms, etc.) influence and foment misinformation? The overarching goal will to become more aware and critical of propaganda we encounter so we can avoid "garbage" information which can manipulate us and prevent us from reasoning logically and ethically.

Course Objectives: Ideally, by the end of this course students should gain the following skills:

Familiarization. Understand the historical background of propaganda and its many forms in daily life.

Comprehension. Comprehend the arguments offered for defining, justifying, or criticizing various uses of propaganda.

Critical analysis. Strengthen interpretation and critical analysis skills, especially considering how messages are shaped by context (media and audience). Criticize arguments by pointing out where they lack evidence, make an unreasonable leap, hold a false assumption, etc.

Empathy and imaginative projection. Reflect how diverse interpretations of messaging can promote understanding and respect for other perspectives.

Understand how changing technologies and information media reshape information, education, political institutions, and societal life.

Responsibility. Increase sensitivity to the moral responsibilities of communicating in a digital age.

Demonstration of the above through writing.

Verbalization. Summarize and criticize positions regarding the above subject matters, without notes, using your own words.

Conversation and Debate. Be able to discuss issues in a focused and informed way with others in the class. This will involve listening closely to their points, then responding in a way that moves the discussion ahead.

Texts

REQUIRED Physical Texts: Available at Tivoli Station bookstore and, if you desire, online (see, for example, http://used.addall.com). If you buy your book online, make sure (1) that it is the correct edition, and (2) that you have it in time for class.

1. Propaganda and the Ethics of Persuasion - 2nd Edition by Randal Marlin, Broadview Press (2013); ISBN-10: 1554810914; ISBN-13: 978-1554810918

REQUIRED Online Texts: Readings and resources will be posted on CANVAS.

1. UCD Canvas site https://ucdenver.instructure.com (CANVAS)

Canvas/Website: There are two online sites related to this course. Familiarize yourself with them right away. Both will offer you access to information about the course such as study questions, announcements, grades, extra credit assignments.

- 1. The first and most important one is our course Canvas site: https://ucdenver.instructure.com/. On this page are LOGIN INSTRUCTIONS. Please make sure you enroll right at the beginning of the class.
- 2. The second site is my home page at http://www.davidhildebrand.org. Here there are a variety of general study tips and resources in philosophy.

Time Management and Expectations about Reading/Understanding Material

Time Per Week: Many of us have responsibilities that compete with this class. Though I am sympathetic, these will not excuse poor attendance or late work. **Expect to spend approximately 5 hours per week on this course, out of class.** If short term, non-emergency illnesses or other contingencies create problems with attending class or completing assignments in a timely manner, students must notify me before class time by email or phone message. I will discuss the matter with students during the next class meeting or schedule an appointment at that time if needed. I will only consider an extension if I receive notification prior to the class or deadline except in cases of documented emergency.

Propaganda Hildebrand Fall 2023 3/13

Readings: It is expected that you have done the readings before we discuss them. As you read, copy out important points and questions you have onto a separate sheet of paper. (These will help you with your short reflection papers.) You may also want to note problem passages (e.g., with a "?" or "Q.") in your text as you read. These are good points for class discussion. You should come to class able to discuss the main issues of the reading and you could be asked during class to present the main points to the class. Your well-prepared participation is crucial for a successful class. Please see the tips section of my website.

Very important: please set aside about 10 minutes shortly before class meetings to look back over (skim-review) the readings and whatever you have written for that day.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS/EVALUATION: Max. points possible: 1000 points

1. **Participation** 160 points

2. **Short writings/presentations (4)** 240 points (60 pts. each, presented on: 9/5, 10/3, 10/31, 11/14)

3. **Team Projects (2)** 300 points (150 pts. each, presented on: 10/3, 10/17)

4. Final Paper/Project 300 points (due: 12/14 by 11:59 p.m.)

Calendar of due dates listed above:

9/5 -- short writing presentation

10/3 -- short writing presentation

10/3 -- team project presentation

10/17 -- team project presentation

10/31 -- short writing presentation

11/14 -- short writing presentation

12/5 -- final project presentation/paper

12/14 -- final project write up/paper

Grades: There are 1000 possible points for this class. I use the plus/minus system. An "A" will be a body of work achieving at or above 930 points; an "A-" will be 900-929 points; a "B+" is 870-899 points, etc. Values for those letters, as well as the policies regarding other grades such as Incomplete, are available in the CU Academic Policies and Regulations section of the handbook. I have set out my standards of what a grade means on my FAQ section of my website.

Graduate student grading standards:

Graduate students will have to do the following for course credit:

- (a) Graduate student final project will be at least 30% longer than undergraduates' final projects.
- (b) Graduate student in-class presentations will be held to a higher standard of preparation and argumentative rigor.
- (c) Graduate student work, overall, will be assessed on a higher level that of undergraduates.

Class modes and Required Attendance: Attendance is required. This class moves through material in weekly assignments (reading and student work). It combines both "synchronous" and "asynchronous" modes of participation.

"Synchronous" weeks. When a week is listed as "synchronous" attendance (via Zoom) is required. The entire class will gather from 5 p.m. to 7:50 p.m. on Zoom. On selected days, an in-person option may also be available, but Zoom will always be a possible way to participate in the class. No inperson attendance will ever be required.

We will meet synchronously on these dates (all Tuesday nights): 8/22, 9/5, 9/12, 10/3, 10/17, 10/31, 11/14, 12/5

"Asynchronous" weeks. When a week is listed as "asynchronous," the class will not meet as a whole. This is a week in which students may work on their own, post to Canvas, and arrange meet ups for team projects.

Attendance Policy. ONE *unexcused* absence over the course of the semester is permitted without penalty. An *excusable* absence is a medical illness or emergency that is completely unavoidable. It is the student's responsibility to talk to me about excusable absences ASAP before or after the absence.

Absences' effect on final grade: Each *additional* absence will lower your final course grade 30 points per absence. E.g., a student with 900 points at the end of the course (an A-) who had 2 *unexcused* absences *in addition to* the ONE allowed would lower their final course average by 60 points (2 x 30 pts.) and wind up with an overall course grade of an 840 (a B). And so forth.

Course Requirements -- Details

(1) PARTICIPATION -- 160 points: Course participation grades are not automatic. They are based on oral contributions to the collective learning experience of the class as a whole in terms of asking pertinent questions, answering questions correctly or, at least, provocatively, making insightful observations, and offering other meaningful expressions of interest in the material that help encourage learning. Shyness is not an excuse—oral participation is part of your evaluation. There will be ample opportunity for active and well prepared participation, which I value.

Participation grades will depend on the following components:

- informed dialogue in synchronous classes
- effective presentation of your short papers in synchronous classes
- active and productive contributions in team projects
- raising questions and comments in class -- these need not be "deep" questions; they can be asking for clarification or explanation at any level

(2) SHORT WRITINGS -- 240 POINTS (4 total, 60 points each; Satisfactory, Unsatisfactory, or Zero)

Propaganda Hildebrand Fall 2023 5/13

The purpose of these assignments is to help you clarify your understanding of the readings and to help you think critically about the issues. **Follow these instructions carefully, please.**

TOOLS FOR SHORT PAPERS: In addition to written answers, papers may utilize video annotation (such as Panopto, Keynote or Powerpoint, screen grabs, etc.) to convey your findings.

Short paper 1.

Written about: Readings on 8/29.

Presented in synchronous class on 9/5.

Question to address: Is there a version of truth or knowledge which seems correct to you? How does that bear on the question, "Should one live in the

Matrix?"

Short paper 2.

Written about: Readings and films assigned to be watched on 10/3

Presented in synchronous class on 10/3

Question to address: Comment on the Jhally film's analysis of advertising. Is the film itself propagandistic? If so, how can its propaganda be

distinguished from advertising, if at all?

Short paper 3.

Written about: Readings on 10/24 and 10/31 Presented in synchronous class on 10/31

Question to address: Make a brief list of conspiracy theories you believe have significance (for yourself, smaller or larger communities, etc.). Which one do you think is most worth investigating and why?

Short paper 4.

Written about: Readings on 11/7

Presented in synchronous class on 11/14

Question to address: Open question. Write about any ethical topic covered by the readings and/or bullshit as discussed by Frankfurt.

WHAT to write on short/critical reaction papers or presentations:

- There are four short papers for this class. Their topics, assignment and presentation dates, and questions are listed above.
- Length and format: 400-700 words. Short papers may utilize images, video, slides, etc.
- No summaries. Do not simply sum up readings. (I.e., no book reports, please.) Answer the question imaginatively and critically.
- The first paragraph should state in 1-2 sentences a summary of what the paper is about.
- Only papers written on assigned reading or topics are acceptable.

PRESENTING short/critical papers:

Propaganda Hildebrand Fall 2023 6/13

- WHEN: Every short paper has a presentation date assigned. Part of your grade on the paper relates to your presentation.
- (a) **briefly explain** the background of the paper (which readings or subject matters you're examining)
- (b) discuss key observations and/or argument. You can use visuals or audio to help you present.
- (c) ask for questions or comments from others in the class; if you don't get any questions, raise a question for brief discussion.
- (d) If you cannot show up to present your short paper, you must record it and post it by the due date.

GRADING on short papers

- Assessment of the papers will depend on their writing and their presentation in class.
- There are three possible grades: S-satisfactory (full credit), U-unsatisfactory (half credit). A zero (0) will be awarded if nothing (or next to nothing) is turned in or for any papers not in by the midpoint/endpoint deadlines.
- ONE MAKE-UP: If you get a Unsatisfactory on a short paper, you may revise and resubmit it. The old grade will be dropped in favor of the revised paper's grade.

(3) Team Projects and Presentations -- 300 points (2 projects x 150 points each)

TOOLS FOR PROJECTS: In addition to written answers, projects may utilize video annotation (such as Panopto, Keynote or Powerpoint, screen grabs, etc.) to convey your findings.

Team Project #1 History & Techniques of Propaganda

WHAT: Team project 1: history and techniques of propaganda. (150 points)

WHEN: Collaboration from 9/19 to 10/3. Presentation on 10/3 in class.

HOW: Team should consider the readings and themes for 9/19 and 9/26 about the history and techniques of propaganda. Here's what to do:

- (a) Decide together on a historical event and/or a technique of propaganda that is especially interesting.
- (b) Search for some audio and/or visual materials that illustrate (a).
- (c) Create a brief 5 minute presentation that lays out the event or technique and have it ready for presentation on 10/3. There should be a write up of the presentation with team names on it to be handed in via Canvas.
- (d) At the 10/3 class meeting, your team presents for 5 minutes and then takes questions for 5+ minutes.
- (e) The assignment will be graded. Any team members that do not participate will get a zero for the assignment.

Team Project #2 Algorithmic Manipulation

WHAT: Team project 2: Algorithmic manipulation. (150 points)

WHEN: Collaboration from 10/10 to 10/17. Presentation 10/17 in class.

HOW: Team should consider the readings and themes for 10/10 and 10/17 On advertising, nudging, and algorithmic manipulation. Here's what to do:

(a) Discuss together the variety of ways to experiment with different ways that algorithms can influence your conduct online — what you see, what choices appear, how various kinds of feeds are affected, types of advertisements, etc. Take a look at handout: Algorithm of You_ How AI Programs Human Behavior in the list of readings.

Propaganda Hildebrand Fall 2023 7/13

(b) Choose two types of manipulations you want to investigate. Devise two tests to see if you can discern how or what manipulation is happening. Carry them out individually, then discuss them briefly and write up a summary of findings — similarities, differences, and any more theoretical conclusions you were lead to.

- (c) Be ready to present for 5 minutes on 10/17 presentation to lay out your findings. A write up including all team members outcomes is expected. It should be handed in via Canvas.
- (d) At the 10/3 class meeting, your team presents for 5 minutes and then takes questions for 5+ minutes.
- (e) The assignment will be graded. Any team members that do not participate will get a zero for the assignment.

(4) FINAL PAPER/PROJECT (300 points)

WHAT: Individual assignment; paper must be at least 1500 words for undergraduates, 2500 words for graduate students.

WHEN: Due by 11:59 pm on December 14, 2023.

HOW: A more detailed assignment will be released. Possible topics may include (a) conspiracy theories, (b) ethical stakes of propaganda, and (c) possibly other topics. It may also invite you to try creating your own propaganda, along with an account of how you invented it, the purposes it could serve, along with any images, audio, video, etc. it might use to persuade.

University Deadlines and Registrar Policies

University policies and academic calendars can be found here: https://catalog.ucdenver.edu/cu-anschutz/academic-standards-policies/academic-calendars/

For relevant university deadlines and procedures (such as the last day to withdraw from a course) as well as academic support sites, please see this website: https://www.ucdenver.edu/student/calendars/academic/fall

Course Policies

Plagiarism/ Academic Dishonesty *Plagiarism* is a form of stealing. It occurs when an author uses the words or ideas of others as if they were the author's own original thought. (It may include using AI generated text such as ChatGPT, word-for-word copying, interspersing one's own words with another's, paraphrasing, inventing or counterfeiting sources, submitting another's work as one's own, neglecting quotation marks on material that is otherwise acknowledged.) Plagiarism is often unintentional. It can be avoided by always acknowledging one's debt to others by citing the exact source of a quotation or paraphrase. Since plagiarism is such a serious violation of academic honesty, the PENALTY for it will be an AUTOMATIC F FOR THIS COURSE.

Academic dishonesty is the intentional disregard of course or university rules. This may include (but is not limited to) collaborating with others when rules forbid or using sources/experts not permitted by an assignment. The CU handbook has a more complete description of plagiarism and academic dishonesty.

Access, Disability, Communication: The University of Colorado Denver is committed to providing reasonable accommodation and access to programs and services to persons with disabilities. Students with disabilities who want academic accommodations must register with Disability Resources and Services (DRS), 177 Arts Building, phone (303) 315-3510, https://www.ucdenver.edu/offices/disability-resources-and-services

I will be happy to provide approved accommodations, once you provide me with a copy of DRS's letter. [DRS requires students to provide current and adequate documentation of their disabilities. Once a student has registered with DRS, DRS will review the documentation and assess the

Propaganda Hildebrand Fall 2023 8/13

student's request for academic accommodations in light of the documentation. DRS will then provide the student with a letter indicating which academic accommodations have been approved.

Students called for military duty: If you are a student in the military with the potential of being called to military service and /or training during the course of the semester, you are encouraged to contact your school/college Associate Dean or Advising Office immediately.

Course Communication: In addition to announcements made and written handouts distributed in class, I may need to contact you between classes, which I'll do through individual and group email messages. One of the requirements for this course is that you maintain an email address, check it regularly for messages, be sure it is working, and let me know if you change your email address. You are responsible for any messages, including assignments and schedule changes, I send you via email. You also may contact me via email, in addition to seeing me during office hours or calling me.

Civility and Technology: Turn off cell phones during class. Text messaging, web surfing, and other electronic distractions may result in expulsion from class and will be counted as an absence and against the class "participation" grade. Students who are speaking deserve your attention and respect as much as I do. Listen to one another. Adherence to the Student Conduct Code is expected.

Contact Information and Office Hours

Phone: 303-315-7218 Canvas course site: ucdenver.instructure.com E-mail:david.hildebrand@ucdenver.edu Additional website: davidhildebrand.org

Office: Via Zoom Hours: Zoom hours by appointment. Phone also an option.

Purpose of office hours: I *strongly* encourage you to participate by arranging office hours. We can talk about the class readings and lectures, exams and papers, your progress, or just philosophy in general. Note: If you are a student with a disability, I will make myself available to discuss appropriate academic accommodations. Before accommodations will be made, you may be required to provide documentation.

Students with disabilities will be accommodated. Students with disabilities are required to register disabilities with the UCD Disability Services Office, and are responsible for requesting reasonable accommodations at the beginning of the term.

NOTE: ALL COURSE REQUIREMENTS SUBJECT TO CHANGE AT DISCRETION OF THE INSTRUCTOR.

Course Schedule: Readings and Assignments

All readings are required unless noted as "recommended." All readings will come either (a) PEP by Marlin or (b) ONLINE on Canvas. Look for it by its title. I will attempt to put readings on Canvas in the order we will get to them. **Assignments and due dates in RED.**

Note: This is a rough schedule. Subject to revision. I will let you know in each class if something different is coming up.

MODE	Day	Date	Required & Suggested Readings, Films, etc.	Theme/Focal Question	Assignments and		
P = Synchronous with in person and Zoom options					Presentations		
S = Synchronous Zoom A = Asynchronous							
P = in person/or Zoom	Т	8/22	Introduction to class, syllabus, one another HOBBS EXERCISE Analyzing Contemporary Propaganda, Lesson 1	Introduction to course and to one another. Discussion of propaganda and some fun games!			
TRUTH							
A = Asynchronous	Th	8/29	Brief introduction to Epistemology and Truth Hendricks Chapters 1, 2	Truth, Knowledge, and Epistemology 1 What do we care about when we	Write Short Paper 1 about this week's		
			• Pryor, "What's So Bad about Living in the Matrix?"	care about truth?	materials.		
S = Synchronous Zoom	Т	9/5	W.K. Clifford, "The Ethics of Belief" 2017 Kolbert New Yorker, "Why Facts Don't Change Our Minds" 2008 Kolbert "What Was I Thinking?"	Truth, Knowledge, and Epistemology 2 Is there an ethical duty to be factual-truthful?	Present Short paper 1.		
PROPAGANDA — DEFIN	ITION	S, HIS	STORY, AND TECHNIQUES				
S = Synchronous Zoom)/1 2	 Why Study Propaganda? (PEP ch 1) Postman, "Propaganda" Welch, D. (2003). Propaganda, definitions of. (Encyclopedia entry) 	Why Study Propaganda? What is at stake in studying propaganda? How have definitions changed over the years and what seems useful or viable now as a definition?			
A = Asynchronous	Т	9/19	History of Propaganda (PEP ch 2)	Historical perspective, continued and making connections to our present circumstances. What are the different techniques used by propaganda? How should these be understood and categorized?	Team Project 1: Collaboration begins using this week's materials.		

A = Asynchronous	Th	9/26	(a) Propaganda Technique (PEP ch 3) (b) Orwell "Politics and the English Language" (ONLINE)	Continued inquiry into the methods of propaganda, with a special focus by Orwell on language and politics.	Team Project 1: Collaboration continues using this week's materials.
PROPAGANDA — FUNCT	IONS	S IN PO	DLITICAL AND ECONOMIC LIFE		
S = Synchronous Zoom	Т	10/3	 Advertising and PR (PEP ch 5); FILM: Jhally, Advertising at the Edge of the Apocalypse FILM: Kilbourne, Killing Us Softly 4: Advertising's Image of Women 	Propaganda as Economic 1: Advertising, Nudging, Algorithms Advertising is a near-omnipresent form of propaganda What are the specific goals of ads? How do they influence our beliefs and identity? Also, advertising has become the main storyteller in our culture. How does that affect our happiness, our social relationships, and the sustainability of our planet? How did advertising in American to become it's main form of "rhetoric" according to Boorstin?	Project 1 (based upon 9/19 and 9/26) Present Short
A = Asynchronous	Th	10/10	 Lippke, "Advertising and the Social Conditions of Autonomy" 2019 Zuboff, "Surveillance Capitalism and the Challenge of Collective Action" Hobbs on Zuboff "2020 Hobbs Propaganda in an Age of Algorithmic Personalization" 	Propaganda as Economic 2 Advertising, Nudging, Algorithms To what degree is our autonomy, our reflective agency compromised by advertising and digital/ algorithmic manipulation?	Team Project 2: Collaboration begins using this week's materials.

	1	1					
P = in person/or Zoom	T	10/17	1 0	Propaganda as Political: Ideology.			
			• Stanley: <i>How Propaganda Works</i> , Ch. 6	Here we consider Jason Stanley's	NS for Team		
			 Pottle, "The Greatest Flood of Mass 		Project 2 on		
			Suggestion": John Dewey, Propaganda, and	1 2 2	Algorithms.		
			Epistemic Costs of Social Organization	bear upon democratic (or non-			
				democratic) forms of life. We'll also			
			Suggested only: Stanley, Chapter 5	look at an analysis of propaganda			
				utilizing John Dewey's theory of the			
				public and inquiry's role in			
				democracy.			
EPISTEMIC AND ETHICAL IMPLICATIONS OF PROPAGANDA							
A = Asynchronous	Th	10/24	• 2018 Coady Conspiracy Theories The	Propaganda as Conspiracy	Write Short		
			Philosophical Debate CHAPTER 1.pdf	Theories (1)	Paper 3 about		
			• 2018 Keely in Coady Conspiracy Theories	A lot of propaganda takes the form	this week's		
			The Philosophical Debate CHAPTER 4.pdf		materials.		
			•	of us dismiss them, there is more to			
				investigate than meets the eye.			
				We'll learn about the epistemic,			
				psychological, and political			
				dimensions of such theories by			
				reading a few articles.			
S = Synchronous Zoom	T	10/31	Cassam on conspiracy theories	Continued exploration of	PRESENT		
			1 7	conspiracy theories' epistemic,	Short Paper 3		
=			• 2023 Cassam Conspiracy Theories	psychological, ethical, and political	•		
			Society.pdf	implications.			
			• 2015 Cassam The intellectual character of	1			
			conspiracy theorists Aeon Essays				

A = Asynchronous	Th	11/7	•	Ethics of Propaganda (PEP ch 4)	Ethics of Propaganda 1	Write Short
			•	Frankfurt, "On Bullshit" (article)	1	Paper 4 about
					questions raised earlier, we draw	this week's
					them together here to ask, What are	materials.
					some main ways or theories of	
					distinguishing "right" from "wrong"	
					and how might they apply to	
					propaganda? How can ethical	
					theories help adjudge the morality	
					of different forms and uses of	
					propaganda?	
					Also, what about "bullshit"? Is that	
					a different threat or just a special	
					kind of propaganda? Does this	
					remand us to considering Clifford's	
					argument relating evidence and	
					ethics?	
S = Synchronous Zoom	T	11/14	•		1 0	PRESENT
			•		l -	Short Paper 3
					How far can "free expression" be	about this week's
			•	Lynch, "The Outrage Factory"	expected to go, as a right? As a	materials.
					thought experiment, perhaps	
					propaganda is just part of "free	
					expression" and deserves to be left	
					alone. What do we mean by "free	
					expression," and what are the	
					reasons for or against it? We'll also consider the way we are "nudged"	
					or "incentivized" by government,	
					commercial, and technological	
					forces. Are these ways of nudging	
					or encouraging our behavior	
			1		acceptable? Do they impinge upon	
					iaccebtable? Do they imblige inon	
					our "free expression"? How would	

	Th	11/21	Thanksgiving		
A = Asynchronous	T	11/28		Propaganda and the Responsibility of other Institutions — News and Objectivity News and Objectivity. Considering the problem posed by (some) propaganda, we need to examine how institutions of media both amplify propaganda and can also help defuse it. Postman's observations about the function of much media to entertain as well as his own definition of propaganda will be considered, along with analyses by Hobbs. Suggested additional readings take up Noam Chomsky's and Edward Herman's influential "propaganda model" which claims that what we hear and see are shaped by larger economic forces, and Jay Rosen's article examining the problematic forms of "objectivity" which tend to skew media coverage toward dominant narratives rather than critical or freshly empirical takes.	
P = in person/or Zoom	Th	12/5	Discussion of final papers and/or projects. Wrap up and final presentations		
	Th	12/14	FINAL Project Paper DUE by 11:59 pm		